Subtitling Strategies of Buya Hamka Vol.1 Movie and Its Implication for Teaching Translation

Lafziatul Hilmi  
Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia  
lafziatulhilmi26@upi.edu

Syihabuddin  
Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia  
syihabuddin@upi.edu

Abstract
The existences of subtitling (a part of audiovisual translation) in assisting people from other countries to enjoy movies have been new breakthroughs yet challenges to film industries. Nowadays, many Indonesian movies present the richness of local languages such as Javanese language, Minangkabau language, Batak language, and other local languages accompanied by English subtitles, so the movies can be watched not only by Indonesian audiences, but also viewers from other countries. One of the movies is Buya Hamka Vol.1 movie. This study aims to reveal the subtitling strategies used in Buya Hamka Vol.1 movie and its implication to teaching translation. The data were the excerpts of conversations using Minangkabau language (source language) compared to the correspond English (target language) subtitle provided by Netflix, and were analysed by using subtitling strategies theory by Gottlieb. This was a qualitative study with content analysis design with purposive sampling technique. The result showed that transfer is the most frequently strategy found in the study because of the common word order pattern employed in Minangkabauense and English.

Keywords: audiovisual translation, subtitling strategies, local languages, minangkabauense, buya hamka

INTRODUCTION

Indonesian film industries recently expose more films using local languages such as ‘Yowis Ben’ in Javanese, ‘Marlina si Pembunuh dalam Empat Babak’ in Sumbanese, ‘Uang Panai’ in Bugis language, ‘Liam and Laila’ in Minangkabauense and many more. This kind of films include the use of local language in the daily conversation. Some of them are mixed with the use of Indonesian language to make sure some contexts are understandable by the common Indonesian audiences. However, these films are not only promoted for Indonesian viewers but also for foreign viewers who perhaps do not mastery Indonesian language or any specific local...
languages. In fact, they do not necessarily master the languages used in the film because they are able to enjoy it through the ease of subtitle.

Subtitling is one of audiovisual translation in poly-semiotic media in form of one or more lines of written text presented on the screen in sync with the original verbal content (Gottlieb, 2012). In other words, the original utterances of the characters in the films are reconstructed in form of written texts and usually appear in bottom part of the screen to share the meaning from the source language to the language of the target audiences. The existence of subtitling is to support the viewers in understanding the film without any distractions because it should be synced with the right moments of original video appear (Cavalheiro, 2021). Therefore, the technical aspects such as time and space should be considered to ensure the subtitle are well-translated.

Translating a subtitle involves the process with certain techniques, methods and strategies. This study employed the subtitling strategies from Gottlieb consisting of ten strategies as summarized by Hosseinnia (2014) as follows: 1) expansion, 2) paraphrase, 3) transfer, 4) imitation, 5) transcription, 6) dislocation, 7) condensation, 8) decimation, 9) deletion, and 10) resignation. The use of these strategies enables the translators to transfer the certain message in the utterances and brings context of the source language to the target language.

In Indonesia, the recent studies about subtitling analysis vary in the terms of whose theories are used, what types of film investigated, or what pairs of languages of subtitles studies. There are some theories of translation commonly used by scholars to analyse subtitles of films. First, the translation techniques of Molina and Albir was used in analysing subtitle of ‘The Kissing Both’ movie by Nopiyadi et. al (2023). This is a teen romantic comedy movie with Indonesian subtitle. They found out that reduction technique was mostly used in the subtitle translation of this movie. Second, the translation strategies of Mona Baker were employed in transferring meaning of English idioms of subtitle in ‘Pitch Perfect 3’ movie by Destarian et.al (2019). In this teen movie, the subtitle analysed was from English to Indonesia. The result showed that paraphrase strategy was used more often in translating English idioms to Indonesian. The next research used Gottlieb’s subtitle strategy to analyse ‘Zootopia’ movie by Wigraha et.al (2022). It is an animated movie with Indonesian subtitle. They found that expansion and paraphrase were frequently used to transfer the meaning of subtitles. Finally, the translation procedure of Newmark was used to analyse subtitle containing swearing words in ‘Joker’ movie by Hasibuan et. al. (2021). Joker is American thriller movie with Indonesian subtitle. The findings revealed that cultural equivalent procedure was mostly used in translating the swear words in this movie.

From the previous studies above, it can be seen that the common research on subtitling analysis used different theories which actually lead to the same techniques or strategies. All those techniques and strategies can be used to conduct analyses on subtitle translation. Then, the movies studied are mostly from western movies which have English as original source language and Indonesian as the target languages. So, the translation involves the transferring meaning from English to Indonesian languages. Unfortunately, there are only few scholars interested in conducting studies about subtitle from Indonesian to English, or even from a certain local language in Indonesia to English. It is supposed to be a concern in subtitling studies because every region or local language has different linguistic aspects, patterns, and ideologies, and it leads to different strategies to transfer the meaning. Therefore, this study focuses on analysing one of Indonesian movie using a local language, Buya Hamka Vol.1 movie, and its English subtitle by using Gottlieb’s theory.

Buya Hamka Vol.1 movie is a biographical drama film directed by Fajar Bustomi. This movie is based on Buya Hamka’s life story when he was a committee of Muhammadiyah
Subtitling Strategies of Buya Hamka Vol.1 Movie and Its Implication for Teaching Translation

Lafziatul Hilmi, Syihabuddin
Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia

organization and an editor-in-chief of Pedoman Masyarakat magazine in North Sumatera (Saadila et al., 2023). Buya Hamka faced many difficulties in spreading the news to Indonesian citizen under colonialization of Japan. When he tried to negotiate with Japanese army, Buya Hamka was defamed and pushed away from the organization (Thamrin, et. al., 2024). Even so, Buya Hamka still continued da’wah in mosques or through his writings.

Buya Hamka movie contains Minangkabaunese utterances, especially when Buya Hamka talked to Siti Raham, his wife, Hajj rasul, his father, or his friends in Padang Panjang. Because these conversations are important parts of the movie to see how Buya Hamka is faithful and working so hard to do da’wah in true spirit, it is important to look at deeply how the translation process occurs to transfer the meaning from Minangkabaunese to English. Therefore, the study was conducted by referring to the following research questions: 1) what are subtitling strategies used in translating Minangkabaunese utterances to English in Buya Hamka Vol.1 movie? 2) How is its implication for teaching translation?

METHOD

This study was conducted by using a qualitative research design. Data were attained from the script of Buya Hamka movie and its English subtitle provided by Netflix through documentation. This research uses a purposive sampling technique; the sample is determined through consideration of certain characteristics that have been determined by the researcher on subjects that are in accordance with the research objectives (Yanti et al, 2022). A purposive sampling technique was employed with specific criteria: conversations in Minangkabaunese between Buya Hamka and his associates, such as Siti Raham, and Hajj Rasul, and the corresponding English subtitles. The utterances and their translations were analysed by using the subtitle strategies theories from Gottlieb.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

What are subtitling strategies used in translating Minangkabaunese utterances to English in Buya Hamka Vol.1 movie?

This study intended to analyse the subtitle strategies of Minangkabaunese utterances and their English translation in Buya Hamkan Vol.1 movie using the theory of Gottlieb as cited in Ghaemi and Benyamin (2010). The findings of the analyses showed that there are five strategies use to transfer the meaning from Minangkabaunese to English, such as expansion, paraphrase, transfer, condensation, and deletion. The percentage of the whole analysis can be seen in table 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subtitling strategies</th>
<th>Data</th>
<th>Percentage (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Expansion</td>
<td>13</td>
<td>6.25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paraphrase</td>
<td>89</td>
<td>42.78</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transfer</td>
<td>93</td>
<td>44.71</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Condensation</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>5.28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Deletion</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>0.96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>208</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Data processed by SPSS
From the table above, it can be tailored that transfer (44.71%) and paraphrase (42.78%) strategies are the most frequently used strategies among others. Then, it is followed by expansion (6.25%), condensation (5.28%) and deletion (0.96). The further discussion of each strategy is narratively described as follow:

**a. Transfer**

Transfer is the strategy in which the pattern and structure of the target text is as same as the source text completely and accurately. It is also known as accurate translation because it is reproduced as exactly as possible the meaning of the source text. Compared to Newmark’ theory, this strategy is made of word-for-word translation, so the target text is translated exactly the same as the source text without changing the pattern and structure (Rusyanti, 2015). The examples of transfer strategy can be seen in the following explanation.

**Datum 12.**
Minangkabaun utterance: *Basobok jo para ulama tu mambuek ambo risau, Ummi.*

English subtitle : Meeting a lot of ulama makes me anxious, Ummi.

In datum 12, it can be seen that the both sentences use the same word order pattern; that is subject-verb-object. Then, both sentences are started with nominalization of verb ‘meet’ as ‘basobok’ and ‘meeting’, the verbs as ‘mambuek’ and ‘makes’, the direct objects as ‘ambo’ and ‘me’, and the compliments as ‘risau’ and ‘anxious’.

**Datum 39**
Minangkabau utterance : *Alah angku tantuan judulnyo?*

English subtitle : Have you decided on the title?

In datum 39, the utterance is in form of question. The word ‘alah’ means having done something completely as in perfect tense. In this case, Siti Raham asked Buya Hamka if he had decided the title of the manuscript. This translation also employed the transfer strategy because the structures and word order patterns of both sentences are exactly the same.

**Datum 169**
Minangkabau utterance : *Urang tu indak tau apo yang alah Angku Haji alami.*

English subtitle : They don’t know what you have been going through.

In datum 169, Siti Raham emotionally talked to Buya Hamka about how to respond to his colleagues toward the defamation he dealt with in Muhammadiyah organization. The words ‘Angku Haji’ is used to replace the pronoun ‘you’ because in Minangkabau it is more polite to address someone older by using the epithet such as ‘Bapak, Angku, etc.’ instead of ‘you’. Both sentences are in negative form with the use of negative marks ‘indak’ and ‘do not’. The sentences also use a noun clause after the verbs ‘indak tau’ and ‘don’t know’. So, this utterance is also transferred by using the transfer strategy.

**b. Paraphrase**

Paraphrase is a strategy to reconstruct the original meaning with the same syntax of the target text. In paraphrasing, the surface of the translated text seems different from the original one but it still carries the same meaning. The use of paraphrasing strategy can be seen in the following explanation.

**Datum 50.**
Minangkabau utterance : *Beko lalok jo ayah yo.*

English subtitle : I will sleep with you later.

In datum 50, Buya Hamka talked to his son when his son woke up suddenly because of nightmare. He tried to soothe him and said he would accompany him sleeping. The Minangkabaunese utterance is started with the word ‘beko’ as the adverb of time and followed by the word ‘lalok’ as verb. Then, the subject ‘ayah’ is placed at the end of the sentence. English does not have this kind of word order pattern. According to Velupillai (2012), it is been studied by most scholars that English has very rigid word pattern. The common and acceptable pattern
of declarative sentence is subject-verb-object. It can be the reason that in the English subtitle version, the sentence is reconstructed to be subject ‘I’ and verb ‘will sleep’ to make the English audience understand the meaning of the original utterance. Therefore, the paraphrasing strategy is used to make sure the meaning is well-translated and transferred to the foreign audiences.

Datum 113.
Minangkabau utterance : Kok sakik, baru ayah agiah tau ka waang.
English subtitle : I will let you know if I’m sick.

In datum 113, this is an utterance when Hajj Rasul, Buya Hamka’s father, talked to him. In this moment, Buya Hamka asked for his father health. The original utterance is begun with the conditional clause ‘kok sakik’ which means ‘if I’m sick’. The following clause showed the main clause with subject ‘ayah’, verb ‘agiah tau’ and object ‘ka waang’. The subtitle then is translated by reordering the clauses because this pattern is more acceptable and understandable for the audiences.

Datum 155.
Minangkabau utterance : Kini ndak ado undangan rapek untuak ambo.
English subtitle : They’ve stopped inviting me to meetings.

In datum 155, Buya Hamka explained how the Muhammadiyah committees reacted to him after the defamation. The original utterance is started with the negation mark and literally it is supposed to be translated as ‘now, there is no more meeting invitation for me’. However, regarding the context of the utterance, the translator change the point of view and reconstruct the new sentence to emphasize that Buya Hamka was no longer invited to any meetings.

c. Expansion

Expansion is the strategy when more explanation is needed to transfer the meaning to the target text, especially when it is related to cultural context. Consequently, the target text becomes longer than the source text. The examples of expansion strategy can be seen from the following explanations.

Datum 79.
Minangkabau utterance : Rancak bana
English subtitle : It’s a great read.

In datum 79, it was shown a teacher introduced the books written by Buya Hamka, and he asked his students to read those books, one of them was ‘Tenggelamnya Kapal Van Wijck’. This utterance was his response about the book. In Minangkabau, the phrase ‘Rancak bana’ is used to express something wonderful, and amazing. It was supposed to be translated as ‘so amazing’, ‘very wonderful’ or even ‘so great’. However, in this subtitle, this phrase is translated into a clause and there is addition of the word ‘read’ to emphasize that the book is really good to read.

Datum 100.
Minangkabau utterance : Doakan sajo, Ummi.
English translation : Just pray for me, Ummi.

In datum 100, Buya Hamka talked to Siti Raham about his next moves in giving Da’wah. The original utterance showed the use of verb ‘doakan’ and the translation is ‘pray’. Then, the translation adds more word as ‘for me’ to stress that the pray was intentionally asked for himself. So, there are extended words to make the meaning more understandable for the audiences.

d. Condensation

In condensation strategy, the target text is shortened with the least obstructive ways, so it becomes as short as possible. Commonly, this strategy involves omitting word, phrase or clause, but it still carries out the accurate original meaning of the source text. The example of condensation strategy can be seen as follows.

Datum 11.
Minangkabau utterance: Alun salasai juo laporan kongresnyo, Angku?
English subtitle: Still not done with the congress report, Engku?
In datum 11, Siti Raham asked Buya Hamka if the Muhammadiyah congress has finished or not because Buya Hamka was still writing the report. The original sentence should be literally translated into ‘Haven’t you finished writing the congress report, Engku?’ because the utterance is in form of question. Nevertheless, the subtitle is written as informal way by omitting the question pattern, and it makes the translation sounds informal. Thus, the meaning conveyed from this translation is still the same as the original one.

**Datum 109.**
Minangkabau utterance: nio maaja disiko?
English subtitle: teach here?
In datum 109, Hajj Rasul asked Buya Hamka when he intendedly worked in the school. The translation of the original utterance is supposed to be as ‘do you want to teach here?’ However, the sentence is shortened by only said ‘teach here?’ with the question mark at the end. This translation is accurate and acceptable for the audience, especially with the help of visual movements of the characters.

e. **Deletion**

Deletion strategy involves the total elimination of parts of a text. It happens if the part of the sentence is less important, so some elements might be deleted but still carry the whole meaning of the source text. The use of deletion strategy can be seen as follow.

**Datum 108.**
Minangkabau utterance: Niaik ambo, ambo ka maaja disiko.
English subtitle: I would like to teach here.
In datum 108, Buya Hamka stated his intention to teach at school to his father, Hajj Rasul. In the original utterance, the words ‘niaik ambo’ are used to say the goal, but in English subtitle, this phrase is completely deleted. It seems that the words ‘would like’ can represent the intention of the previous phrase.

**Datum 191.**
Minangkabau utterance: Ambo agak talaik pulang.
English subtitle: I’m late.
In datum 191, Buya Hamka asked for apology because he came home a bit late. The original utterance used the words ‘agak talaik pulang’ which were supposed to be translated as ‘coming home late’. However, this utterance was just translated as ‘I’m late’. This translation is understandable by the audience because visually they can see the context of this utterance.

From all the data presented, it can be revealed that mostly used strategy in translation of Minangkabaunese utterances to English subtitles are transfer strategy. In transferring strategy, the subtitles are rendered completely like the original utterance in forms of structure and word order pattern. Most of the Minangkabau utterances in Buya Hamka movie are in the pattern of subject-verb-object and their translations are also in subject-verb-object word order. So, the transfer strategy can be found more frequently in the subtitle analysis. Compared to a study conducted by Rusianty (2015), the result showed that paraphrase was applied mostly in the subtitle of The Raid: Redemption movie. It was an Indonesian movie and also provided English subtitle for the audiences. The paraphrase strategy was used to get greater clarity of the dialogues which had difficult constructions of syntactic form. Therefore, even though both movies are translated into the English subtitle, the different source languages of them result in different types of strategies in the process of translation.

2) **How are the subtitle practice impactful for teaching translation?**
Subtitling is a part of audiovisual translation which gains more concerns in film industries to make the films more accessible for domestic and foreign viewers. This became consideration for teaching translation, especially in universities and colleges, to provide and support the students as the prospective subtitlers in the future. The students should possess linguistic competences and translation competences. These competences can be carried out as the basic skills for them to look for a job or to set up their own translation business (Hilmi and Safitri, 2022).

Al-Dabbagh (2017) summarized some advantages to raise the interest in subtitling in occupying the translation studies curricula. First, introducing subtitling course in translation studies curricula will provide the students with the insight of being future subtitlers and facilitate them with the theories and practices before they join the workforce. Second, the practices of subtitling can foster the translations skills and develop the translation performances of using any strategies employed in the transferring audiovisual text. Next, teaching subtitling can improve the foreign language learning. Not only English, students need to comprehend the pairs of languages they transfer linguistically so that the translation competences can used to perform the translation process. Finally, subtitling also means transferring the culture and ideology awareness of the source text to the target text.

Regarding to the beneficial of subtitling studies, the translation curricula should include the subtitling studies as well as another audiovisual translation, dubbing, to be integrated in teaching translation. Subtitling strategies should also be introduced to the students to ensure they have capability to do translation and understand how these strategies can be applied in the process of transferring meaning of source language to the target language.

CONCLUSION

Based on the findings above, the subtitling strategies used from Minangkabaunese to English in Buya Hamka Vol.1 movie are transfer, paraphrase, expansion, condensation and deletion. The nature of Minangkabaunese that use subject-verb-object word pattern seems similar to the pattern of English word order; that is subject-verb-object as well. This results in transfer strategy as the most frequently used strategy (44.71%). Paraphrase is also the second-most used strategy because the original utterances are quite difficult to transfer completely as the transfer strategy. The reconstruction of the sentence is needed to keep the original meaning. In further research, the analysis of the subtitle translation of any other local languages is needed to see it from other linguistic aspects.

REFERENCES


Intelektium adalah jurnal yang diterbitkan oleh Neolectura, diterbitkan dua kali dalam satu tahun. Intelektium adalah media publikasi ilmiah dalam bentuk makalah konseptual dan penelitian lapangan yang terkait dengan bidang pendidikan. Diharapkan Intelektium dapat menjadi media bagi akademisi dan peneliti untuk menerbitkan karya ilmiah mereka dan menjadi sumber referensi untuk pengembangan ilmu pengetahuan.


